



# City of Carmel

## **CARMEL PLAN COMMISSION SPECIAL STUDIES COMMITTEE TUESDAY, JANUARY 4, 2005**

### **Minutes**

The Special Studies Committee of the Carmel Plan Commission met in regular session at 7:00 PM in the Caucus Rooms of City Hall on January 4, 2005.

Committee members present: Jerry Chomanczuk; Mark Rattermann; Steve Stromquist; Madeleine Torres, thereby establishing a quorum.

Angie Conn attended the Committee meeting on behalf of the Department of Community Services.

The Special Studies Committee considered the following items:

**1. Docket No. 04090045 ADLS: O'Malia Fireplace**

The applicant seeks approval of a building and parking lot expansion. The site is located at 220 South Range Line Road. The site is zoned B-1/Business.

Filed by Paul Reis of Drewry Simmons Vornehm, LLP for Helen J. O'Malia Trust.

**TABLED** to February

**2. Docket No. 04080013 ADLS Amend: Mayflower Park, Block 6, lot 2 - Ed Martin**

The applicant seeks design approval for parking lot expansion. The site is located southwest of Michigan Road and 99th Street. The site is zoned I-1/Industrial and is within the US 421 Overlay

Filed by Mark Settlemyre of Foresight Engineering for Ed Martin Pontiac.

**Administratively Removed from the Agenda**

**3. Docket No. 04100025 ADLS Amend: Lakeside Park - Amenity Area**

The applicant seeks approval for a revised amenity area site plan. The site is located Southwest of 141st Street & Towne Road. The site is zoned S-1/Residence-Estate.

Filed by Dawn Barnett of Drees Homes.

Dawn Barnett, land development manager with Drees Homes, 6650 Telecom Drive, Suite 200, Indianapolis 46278, appeared before the Committee representing the Lakeside Park development. The landscaping plan initially submitted for this development was not adhered to

S:\PlanCommission\Minutes\SpecialStudyCommittee\2005\2005jan04

and the landscaping installed at the Pool House is significantly different from that which was approved by the Board of Zoning Appeals.

The petitioner referred to the original landscape plan and the actual landscape plan that was done. The original landscape plan had 647 total plantings and trees—the plan ultimately contained 2,835 plantings and trees. The petitioner has taken steps to bring the landscaping into compliance and has installed 215 additional trees behind the pool house and pavilion; these trees are above and beyond the requirement.

Department Report, Angie Conn. The Department is recommending approval

Mark Rattermann moved for approval of **Docket No. 04100025 ADLS Amend, Lakeside Park Amenity Area**, seconded by Steve Stromquist, **APPROVED 4-0**.

**4. Docket No. 04120012 ADLS Amend: CMC Office Center**

The applicant seeks approval for signage and associated landscaping. The site is located at 13295 Meridian Corners Blvd. The site is zoned B5 and is in the US 31 Overlay. Filed by Sherry Marchbanks of Mazda Sign Inc.

Sherry Marchbanks, Mazda Sign Inc., 12429 North Meridian Street, Carmel appeared before the Committee representing the CMC Office Center. The proposed signage will not be stacked, the logo is within the 25% allowed in the Ordinance. The signs are requested for the east and west elevations of the building and would face Meridian Street and the front of their building. The signs are white neon, interior illumination.

At this time, a ground sign is being requested that would identify the center itself, although the two additional buildings have not yet been constructed. The signs would face Meridian Street and the front of the building. The sign has 12-inch letters; the oval part of the logo is 2 feet tall, (24 inches) and about 16 inches on the inside. The petitioner is requesting the ground sign at this time to alleviate a return trip at a future date.

The brick would match the existing materials on the building. The **petitioner has agreed to eliminate the flag elements on the front of the building and on the sign on the 131<sup>st</sup> Street elevation (the south elevation.)**

Department Report, Angie Conn. The site has only two frontages and is permitted only two signs. A variance approval from the Board of Zoning Appeals would be required to allow three signs on this site. The Department has an issue with the size of the logo that is not in line with the letters—24 inches in height rather than 12 inches. The Department did receive letter-type or illumination detail. At this time, the Department recommends that the Committee either table this item or deny the application.

Sherry Marchbanks understood that the third sign (the ground sign) would require a variance from the BZA. As an alternative, the petitioner could simply wait until the next building is built,

then request the ground sign at that time. Currently, there are no signs on the existing building; there has been a banner on the building—it blew off in October and was not replaced.

Jim Cohen, president of CMC Office Center and owner of the building addressed the Committee and explained that the logo is extremely important for branding and recognition. The portion being proposed is not dissimilar to the proportion used on their letterhead and business cards, etc.

Rather than shrinking the logo to make is closer to the letters in “office center,” Mr. Cohen offered to make the letters in “office center” one size larger—the proportion would then be more similar. Right now, the logo represents no more than 25% of the sign.

The petitioner is willing to shrink the logo to 24 inches and the lettering would be 18 inches.

Mark Rattermann moved for approval of two wall signs for **Docket No. 04120012 ADLS Amend, CMC Office Center, conditioned upon** the logo reduced to 24 inches and the letters in “office center” raised to no more than 18 inches. **Approval is also contingent upon** a rendering reflecting the new size being submitted and approved by the Department. Mark Rattermann’s motion was seconded by Steve Stromquist, **APPROVED** 4-0.

**5. Docket No. 04120013 ADLS Amend: David Kristoff DDS**

The applicant seeks approval for signage and associated landscaping. The site is located at 1040 North Range Line Road. The site is zoned B3 and is in the US 31 Overlay. Filed by Jennifer Nally.

Paul Reis, attorney, 8888 Keystone Crossing, Suite 1200 appeared before the Committee representing the applicant. Also in attendance: Dr. Kristoff; Tom Vondesar, landscape architect; Jennifer Nally, business manager for Dr. Kristoff; and Dr. Stewart.

Dr. Kristoff is re-locating his growing dental practice from Range Line Road to the site at 1040 North Range Line Road, just south of the Speedway gas station and north of the Carmel Cemetery. This dental practice has been in the Carmel community for 48 years; Dave Kristoff bought the practice from Dr. Johnson.

Initially, the site was developed as a stripcenter and housed a liquor store and a bakery. One of the unique characteristics of the site is that the grade of US 31 is the highest point; moving south, the grade lowers. The issue is a rather large Speedway gas station that very nearly camouflages the site.

The petitioner will be requesting a total of three signs—two through the Plan Commission and one through the Board of Zoning Appeals by variance. However, in the interest of having the design reviewed by this Committee, all three signs are being presented this evening—two ground signs, one wall sign.

The two ground signs will be identical. One sign will be located just south of the Speedway station, the second sign will be located on the west side of the property in a newly landscaped area along US 31.

The two ground signs will be constructed of marine plywood, trimmed in white with white lettering, the number is gold, the background is Hunter's Green. The ground signs are illuminated—the sign on the building will not be illuminated. Mr. Reis stated that the size of the signs is well within the Sign Ordinance, in fact, the sign along US 31 could be 60 square feet, however it measures 12 square feet. The sign along Range Line Road could be 30 square feet, however it measures 20 square feet.

Dr. Kristoff explained that the placement of the signage is very important—if someone misses the office heading north, they must travel to 151<sup>st</sup> Street, turn around then return. A lot of patients are emergencies, children with teeth knocked out from accidents, and time is of the essence. Five minutes can make a difference whether or not the teeth can be saved. Dr. Kristoff said he was concerned that his patients would be able to find their destination easily and safely. The site is a strange corner—at Range Line Road and US 31, facing neither street—no frontage. Also, the Speedway gas station is a tall building and blocks the site.

Paul Reis reported that Tom Vandesar has preserved all existing plants and is adding additional amount of new plantings. The landscaping is a tremendous enhancement.

Dr. Kristoff said that every operatory has a window, and he did not want his patients looking at a gas station or the road. Therefore, a lot of plantings will be installed.

Department Report, Angie Conn. The site is allowed two signs; the petitioner must appear before BZA for a third sign. The sign on U.S. 31 looks as if it is in the right-of-way.

Paul Reis responded that the sign must be 5 feet back from the right-of-way, and it will not be within the right-of-way. The drawing was to emphasize the landscaping rather than the sign.

Jerry Chomanczuk expressed concern with the placement of the ground sign being in such a highly visible location, i.e. the entrance area to Clay Terrace. The wall signs on the building are OK, but the ground sign is a concern.

Paul Reis clarified that there is one wall sign—two ground signs, one on Range Line and one on US 31. The sign on US 31 is quite small and more a directional sign, even though it is 6 feet tall.

Mark Rattermann commented that he was very comfortable with the building sign and the sign on Range Line Road—that is the address of the business. The sign on US 31 should be less significant.

Jennifer Nally responded that if a motorist is traveling north on US 31, the building is not visible at all. It is totally hidden by the trees and the cemetery landscaping. A person would travel

through the intersection and once beyond the intersection, a person would have to go to 146<sup>th</sup> or 151<sup>st</sup>, turn around and loop back to the intersection.

Paul Reis then offered to redesign the sign on US 31. The two signs, wall sign and Range Line Road sign, are critical now because the office is due to open and signage is needed.

Jerry Chomanczuk again expressed concern with the sign on US 31 and the desire for consistency in the 31 corridor. The petitioner agreed to submit a color rendition of the proposed sign on US 31.

Paul Reis then requested that the Committee approve the wall sign and the sign on Range Line Road if the Committee was OK with the colors. The petitioner is willing to re-design the third sign and further discuss with the Department as to the style and appropriate signage in the 31 corridor.

Mark Rattermann moved for approval of **Docket No. 04120013 ADLS Amend, David Kristoff DDS**, ground sign on Range Line Road and a building sign on the building. The motion is **conditioned upon** the petitioner returning to the Committee next month for review and approval of the ground sign on US 31 (note: the ground sign is conditional, the landscaping is not). Mark Rattermann's motion was seconded by Madeleine Torres, **APPROVED** 4-0.

**6. Docket No. 04120014 ADLS Amend: Skin Sense Med Spa**

The applicant seeks approval for signage. The site is located at 39 W. Main Street. The site is zoned B1 and is within the Old Town District and Sign Boundaries.  
Filed by Mina Desai-Patel.

Mina Desai-Patel and Sindra Patel appeared before the Committee representing the applicant. The site was an existing cookie bakery and the owner re-located. There is an existing pole sign and light fixture, however the sign itself was removed. A 9-foot square sign is being proposed. The logo is approximately 25% of the sign area, the colors and text are shown on the sign rendering submitted.

Department Report, Angie Conn. The Department still needs detail furnished regarding the sign materials and lighting fixture. The Committee should discuss the phone number that appears on the sign.

Mr. Patel stated the sign is alumicor. There are two existing flood light fixtures fastened to the roof that will illuminate the sign.

The petitioner will be utilizing the existing hardware—the existing pole on the face of the building.

Jerry Chomanczuk said there was concern with the signage in this area being reasonably the same height.

Madeleine Torres commented that the sign displays a lot of information; perhaps it could be cut down and also eliminate the telephone number.

Mark Rattermann said he has no strong feelings about the sign—it is a blade sign—a pedestrian sign—and walking it is OK; driving at 30 miles per hour, the sign is way too busy.

Jerry Chomanczuk stated his main concern as the telephone number. For example, the area code is displayed—do they anticipate anyone outside the area code utilizing this facility? The same impact could be achieved with a decal in the window, permitted within limits, with a phone number or website, etc.

Ms. Patel commented that the wording “Where Healthy Skin Begins” is because the business is only skin care—not massages, not nails—skin care only. Ms. Patel offered to minimize the phone number.

Mark Rattermann moved for approval of **Docket No. 04120014 ADLS Amend, Skin Sense Med Spa, conditioned upon** the area code being removed from the sign and the phone number being reduced to one-half the size presented, seconded by Steve Stromquist, **APPROVED** 4-0.

**7. Docket No. 04120016 ADLS Amend: Tom Wood Pre Owned**

The applicant seeks approval for signage. The site is located at 3300 E. 96<sup>th</sup> Street. The site is zoned B3.

Filed by Bill Hutchison.

Bill Hutchison, Hutchison Sign Company, 215 South Muncie Street, Indianapolis, appeared before the Committee representing Tom Wood Pre Owned. The Subaru dealership has been changed and a new facility built; the current dealership will be converted to a “Pre Owned” where previously owned vehicles will be sold.

The proposed sign is the same 2-foot letter as the Subaru and the same span—36 feet—that will compute to a 72 square foot sign. The same colors, blue with white trim, bronze return will be utilized with internally illuminated channel letters. The existing monument sign would match the proposed sign—same colors—and would all tie together with the building. The reason the Nissan logo still appears is because they are still performing Nissan service at this facility.

Department Report, Angie Conn. The Department has not had an opportunity to review the materials. The Department would prefer consistency in the font signage—one portion of the sign is all CAPS, one portion is lower case letters—the petitioner should stick with one type.

Madeleine Torres commented that the sign is confusing.

Mr. Hutchison said there is an existing sign that says “Nissan” and has the Subaru logo where “Pre Owned” is proposed.

Jerry Chonmanczuk was hesitant to take action on the ground sign, since the changes were not submitted previously and neither the Department nor the Committee has had an opportunity to review.

Bill Hutchison stated that previously, Tom Wood Subaru was on the building and Nissan was on the monument sign. What is actually being proposed is “Pre Owned,” everything else is existing.

Mr. Hutchison said that “Tom Wood” is a specific letter font, “Pre Owned” is not. The “Subaru” also had the same block style letters that “Pre Owned” will have.

At this time, the petitioner opted to proceed with the wall sign and return for modifications to the Monument sign.

Steve Stromquist moved for approval of the **wall sign** for Tom Wood Pre Owned, **now referred to as Docket No. 04120016-A ADLS Amend**. At this time, no action will be taken on the existing monument sign or any modification to the existing **ground sign, hereinafter referred to as Docket No. 04120016-B ADLS Amend for Tom Wood Pre Owned**. Madeleine Torres seconded the motion made by Steve Stromquist; the motion was Approved 4-0.

**Note:** The petitioner will return to Committee to address **Docket No. 04120016-B**, modifications to the ground monument sign for Tom Wood Pre Owned.

**8. Docket No. 04120018 ADLS Amend: Electronic Evolutions**

The applicant seeks approval for signage. The site is located at 525 Congressional Blvd.

The site is zoned B-2.

Filed by Doug Kauffman.

Doug Kauffman, 5295 Shiloh Falls, Carmel appeared before the Committee representing Electronic Evolutions for signage. There are two existing locations for Electronic Evolutions and those are being combined into one singular location. Electronic Evolutions is sub-leasing approximately 12,000 square feet of this building from Firestone Building Products at 525 Congressional Boulevard.

The petitioner is requesting approval to utilize an existing sign that came from The Fashion Mall Commons, Keystone Crossing location (formerly the Gateway Computer site.) The letters are individually illuminated channel letters, no visible neon but it is illuminated with neon. The background of the logo does not illuminate, however, the four inter-locking “e’s” with the little number “2” do illuminate.

There is an existing sign on the building to the right that says “Firestone,” and the understanding is that it will be removed, since this will no longer be a Firestone space. Firestone will be located on the other side of the facility. The existing Firestone sign letters are approximately three (3) feet in height—the maximum height is two feet, four inches (2.4 inches) and thirteen (13) feet in length. The Firestone sign would be approximately 13 feet, maybe 14 feet.

Doug Kauffman noted an error in the Department Report that refers to a wall sign on the east elevation; the proposal is for the west elevation. The Firestone sign currently faces south and that is to be removed.

Department Comments, Angie Conn. The Department is recommending that the Committee approve as presented.

Jerry Chomanczuk suggested that REI approval may be required, since they are the management company for Meridian Technology Park and this particular location. (contact person: Julie Christiansen) There may be existing covenants and restrictions that would require compliance by the petitioner.

Mark Rattermann moved for approval of **Docket No. 04120018 ADLS Amend, Electronic Evolutions, with the following conditions: 1) The existing Firestone sign on the building is to be removed. 2) The sign on the west elevation depicted in the drawings and the overall signage is to be approved by the Meridian Technology Park Association if required by their covenants and restrictions.** The motion with conditions was seconded by Madeleine Torres and **APPROVED** 4-0.

**9. Docket No. 04040042 ADLS Amend: Clarian North Hospital Signage**

The applicant proposes modifications to the approved signage plan for Clarian North Hospital. The site is located on the northwest corner of 116th Street and US Highway 31. The site is zoned PUD/Planned Unit Development within the US 31 Overlay Zone. Filed by Joseph Scimia of Baker & Daniels for Clarian Health Partners, Inc.

Joe Scima, attorney with Baker & Daniels, 600 East 96<sup>th</sup> Street, appeared before the Committee representing the applicant as well as Adam Kaiser of Clarian Health Partners. Roger Kilmer, Land Use Specialist with Baker & Daniels was also present.

The petitioner has expressed two concerns with this development—one is the compatibility of the signs with the existing building; the other is that because of the location, the round about and traffic flow, the ambulatory entrance and traffic pattern should be clearly defined on the site. A study was done on the sign package, originally approved for 45 ground signs, with a total square footage of 826 square feet (600,000 square foot facility). Additionally, there were 11 wall signs consisting of primarily of identification signs for each individual wing, emergency, ambulatory services. These have not changed at all—what has changed is that the architectural elements of the signs themselves. The prior signs had a limestone base, Indiana limestone, native brick, and sterling silver/chrome topping and window glazing.

The base is now brick as opposed to the limestone, with a limestone cap. The same chrome features have been added to all the signs. Before, there was a mix between brick and chrome, now they are consistent with the stainless steel insert behind the sign face. Every sign now has the stainless steel insert, brick base, and limestone cap; the individual lettering pretty much stays the same.



Joe Scimia noted that the two signs located at the round about are technically off-premise signs and not on the same side of the road as the hospital. Any approval for these two signs would have to be granted by the BZA. These two signs identify the campus as people approach from the west. Also, people entering the round about need to know how to get through the round about to Meridian Street. This development has been designed with the round about at the request and support of the City of Carmel. However, there are still engineers that have suggested directional signage as cars enter the round about so that motorists know which lane to get into and which lane to utilize to exit onto Meridian. It will be a double-lane round-about and you will have to make a complete revolution in order to get to the exit.

Department Comments, Angie Conn. The Department would like the applicant to meet with the City Engineer to determine whether or not they have concerns with the round-about. Also, the Department is not in favor of raceway mounted signs and would rather have the individual channel letters.

Joe Scimia responded that the signs have not changed—the raceway mounts are the same. The emergency sign changed in square footage, but not the configuration.

Comments from the Committee:

Mark Rattermann was upset that a new sign on the corner of Spring Mill Road was being proposed. Mark Rattermann felt that he had been misled—this is a significant sign, off the development—tantamount to a “billboard” sign.

Joe Scimia explained that one of the signs is on the round about, one is 100 feet west of the round about. All of the signs must come through the Development Plan process. Mr. Scimia was apologetic; there was an apparent misunderstanding.

The applicant tried to make it clear that the Campus Identifier sign located 100 feet west of the intersection is off-site and may need a variance. The sign would alert people to be prepared to turn into the intersection. To those persons who live here or use this area all the time, it would be very common to go through the round-about to get there. The signage is to clearly identify the route for general traffic, not the ambulances. Emergency is probably the most urgent/crucial situation, and that is the reason for the three signs. The red emergency/main entrance sign has been added.

Mark Rattermann remarked that the hospital is an 8-story building and if you can't find it..... This all comes back to the same thing—office buildings west of Illinois Street and now signage proposed west of Illinois—this will bring out the people from Springmill Road all over again, screaming at us about commercial use on the west side of Illinois Street. Mr. Rattermann said he would not vote for a sign west of Illinois Street—it is offsite and does not even pertain to the office buildings west of Illinois Street.

Mr. Scimia said he understood Mark Rattermann's position but felt that public safety is a major concern. When it is an emergency situation, it is not always simple to get around the round

about and into the emergency facility. The sign is not for an advertising impact, it is primarily to get people to where they need to be. We are not advertising products—we are advertising services for a hospital.

Jerry Chomanczuk agreed with comments made by Mark Rattermann.

Joe Scimia said he would amend his petition and delete the two signs with the understanding that if the petitioner decided to go forward with the two signs, they would go to the BZA first, then return to the Plan Commission Special Study Committee.

Jon Dobosiewicz commented that the Committee probably has no problem with the proposed modification of all of the sign types across the site. The problem is these two signs, and if those are deleted from the request, the Committee could act upon the balance of the petition.

There was further discussion regarding the drive for ambulances only and whether or not that would be a gated drive. The problem is that not all ambulances would have the sensors so the gate is not preferred. If the drive ends up being used as a shortcut, the gate would be installed and the ambulances would take a longer route to the emergency facility.

Jerry Chomanczuk commented that most of the traffic will be headed toward the main entrance, women's and children's services, and it puts the ambulance on the same roadway as emergency.

Joe Scimia reported that that this drive is the biggest, and not unlike any other hospital—Carmel St. Vincent, 86<sup>th</sup> Street St. Vincent, or downtown Methodist, etc.—you travel with the populace until you get to the emergency drive into the quick doors.

Jerry Chomanczuk asked about the side road that runs parallel with US 31—will there be any plans to connect to that side road? (The road that goes by the Ritz Charles)

Joe Scimia responded that there are no plans to tie into that road.

Jon Dobosiewicz said the plan is that the Ritz Charles would ultimately have access via Illinois Street.

At this time, Joe Scimia verbally amended his petition/request to delete the two signs at the northwest corner of 116<sup>th</sup> and Illinois Street so that the Committee could proceed with the non-controversial signs. Mr. Scimia said he would meet with his client as the project proceeds and if there is a strong position or belief, the petitioner would return to the Commission. Mr. Scimia said he understood the concern about west of Illinois Street.

Mark Rattermann moved to approve **Docket No. 04040042 ADLS Amend, Clarian North Hospital Signage, as amended** by the petitioner to **exclude consideration of the two off-site signs**—numbers 74 and 75 on the drawings, seconded by Madeleine Torres, **APPROVED 4-0.**

The meeting adjourned at 9:10 PM.

---

Ramona Hancock, Secretary

---

Jerry Chomanczuk, Chairperson